

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

Sixteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Bangkok (Thailand), 3-14 March 2013

Summary record of the eighth session of Committee I

8 March 2013: 9h15 – 12h00

Chair: C. Caceres (Canada)
Secretariat: D. Morgan
Rapporteurs: L. Garrett
J. Gray
R. Parry-Jones
C. Rutherford

The Committee reviewed the summary record in document CoP16 Com. I. Rec. 1. Argentina requested removal of the second reference to itself in the third paragraph under agenda item 16. The Chair asked that references to “working group” in the last paragraph under agenda item 17 and in the penultimate paragraph under agenda item 33 be replaced by drafting group. With these amendments the record was adopted.

Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

Amendment of the Appendices

77. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II

Colombia introduced proposal CoP16 Prop. 23 to transfer the population of *Crocodylus actus* (American crocodile) of Cispatá Bay, Colombia, from Appendix I to Appendix II with an annotation as presented in proposal CoP16 Prop. 23 Addendum (Rev. 1). Colombia noted that this isolated population was showing signs of recovery and, with the significant involvement of local communities, could be sustainably managed.

Argentina, the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela, Brazil, Costa Rica, Cuba, Ecuador, Egypt, Honduras, Indonesia, Liberia, Mexico, Panama, Paraguay, Peru, Qatar, Senegal, Thailand and Uruguay supported the proposal. Both the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela and Peru, as range States for *C. acutus*, recognized the importance of the project’s work in association with local communities. Mexico was satisfied that the amended proposal to include a zero export quota for harvest from the wild would alleviate its earlier concerns that further information was required regarding monitoring and non-detriment findings.

Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, supported by China, Israel, the United States of America and Humane Society International, did not support the proposal, believing that the population still met the biological criteria for inclusion in Appendix I set out in Annex 1 of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP15). It and China also highlighted the fact that the Resolution indicated that split listings should be avoided where possible, as they could create possible enforcement issues. It, supported by Israel and the United States, was aware of the positive efforts made by Colombia in the conservation and management of the species, and suggested either submission at CoP17 of a ranching proposal or the development of draft decisions directed to Colombia, for which they could offer some suggested wording.

The Chair called for a vote on proposal CoP16 Prop. 23 Addendum (Rev. 1) realizing there was no consensus. Fifty-seven Parties voted for the proposal, 50 against and 16 abstained. It therefore failed to reach the two-thirds majority in favour and was rejected (see Annex 1).

With agreement from the Chair to consider proposal CoP16 Prop. 25 before proposal CoP16 Prop. 24, Thailand introduced proposal CoP16 Prop. 25 to transfer the population of Thailand of *Crocodylus siamensis* (Siamese crocodile) from Appendix I to Appendix II. Cambodia, Indonesia, the Lao People's Democratic Republic and Viet Nam, all range States for *C. siamensis*, supported the proposal. This was echoed by Bhutan, Brazil, China, Colombia, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Ecuador, Egypt, Gambia, Madagascar, Nigeria, Pakistan, Philippines, Qatar, Singapore and Uganda.

Switzerland commended Thailand on plans to strengthen the population of this species but could not support the proposal, believing the population still met the biological criteria for inclusion in Appendix I. Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, and the United States, also did not support the proposal, the former adding that this species had been assessed as Critically Endangered by IUCN.

The Chair called for a vote on proposal CoP16 Prop. 25 realizing there was no consensus. Sixty-nine Parties voted for the proposal, 49 against and 11 abstained; the proposal was therefore rejected (see Annex 2).

Thailand introduced proposal CoP16 Prop. 24 to transfer Thailand's population of *Crocodylus porosus* (saltwater crocodile) from Appendix I to Appendix II with a zero quota for wild specimens, emphasizing the successful captive-breeding operations and management systems in place for the species. Brazil, Cambodia, China, Colombia, Gambia, Madagascar, Myanmar, Pakistan, the Philippines and Viet Nam supported the proposal, variously citing the benefits made to the conservation of wild specimens through captive breeding and the contribution to livelihoods.

Australia, India, Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, the Seychelles and the United States opposed the proposal, emphasizing that the Thai population of this species still met the criteria for inclusion in Appendix I, that there was insufficient information in the supporting statement regarding safeguards to ensure conservation of wild populations, and that there were a number of registered captive-breeding facilities in Thailand whence commercial trade in specimens of saltwater crocodiles already could occur legally under conditions laid out in Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP15) on *Registration of operations that breed Appendix-I animal species in captivity for commercial purposes*. Humane Society International noted that, if approved, many more captive-breeding operations could be permitted to trade commercially without being subject to these conditions.

Thailand agreed to a proposal from the Chair to move to a vote on the proposal, but requested this be by secret ballot, and received support for this from 10 Parties, as required by the Rules of Procedure. Sixty-one were in favour, 54 against and six abstained; the proposal was therefore rejected. The United States asked that it be recorded that it had voted against the proposal.

New Zealand presented proposal CoP16 Prop. 26 to include all species of the genus *Naultinus* (green geckos) in Appendix II, pointing out the species concerned were endemic to New Zealand, and that their current inclusion in Appendix III had failed to provide adequate protection. It, echoed by Ecuador, emphasized the relentless nature of organized international criminal networks targeting reptiles prized by collectors. Australia, Chile, Colombia, Cuba, Ecuador, Islamic Republic of Iran, Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, Japan, Kenya, Liberia, Madagascar, Mexico, Peru and Samoa supported the proposal. Prowildlife noted that specimens of this genus were regularly observed on sale at reptile fairs in Germany. The proposal was accepted by consensus.

The meeting was adjourned at 12h00.

VOTE ON AMENDMENT PROPOSAL COP16 PROP. 23 ADDENDUM (REV. 1)
[CROCODYLUS ACUTUS (AMERICAN CROCODILE)]

List provided in English only.

| | | | |
|----|----------------------------------|---|------|
| 1 | Afghanistan | 0 | NA |
| 2 | Albania | 0 | NA |
| 3 | Algeria | 1 | NV |
| 4 | Antigua and Barbuda | 1 | YES |
| 5 | Argentina | 1 | YES |
| 6 | Armenia | 1 | YES |
| 7 | Australia | 1 | NO |
| 8 | Austria | 1 | NO |
| 9 | Azerbaijan | 1 | NO |
| 10 | Bahamas | 1 | NO |
| 11 | Bahrain | 1 | ABST |
| 12 | Bangladesh | 0 | NA |
| 13 | Barbados | 0 | NA |
| 14 | Belarus | 1 | YES |
| 15 | Belgium | 1 | NO |
| 16 | Belize | 1 | NO |
| 17 | Benin | 1 | YES |
| 18 | Bhutan | 1 | ABST |
| 19 | Bolivia (Plurinational State of) | 0 | NA |
| 20 | Bosnia and Herzegovina | 1 | NV |
| 21 | Botswana | 1 | YES |
| 22 | Brazil | 1 | YES |
| 23 | Brunei Darussalam | 1 | YES |
| 24 | Bulgaria | 1 | NO |
| 25 | Burkina Faso | 1 | NO |
| 26 | Burundi | 1 | NV |
| 27 | Cambodia | 1 | YES |
| 28 | Cameroon | 1 | NO |
| 29 | Canada | 1 | NO |
| 30 | Cape Verde | 0 | NA |
| 31 | Central African Republic | 1 | NV |
| 32 | Chad | 0 | NA |
| 33 | Chile | 1 | NO |
| 34 | China | 1 | YES |
| 35 | Colombia | 1 | YES |
| 36 | Comoros | 1 | NVP |
| 37 | Congo | 1 | YES |
| 38 | Costa Rica | 1 | YES |
| 39 | Côte d'Ivoire | 1 | NV |
| 40 | Croatia | 1 | NO |

| | | | |
|----|----------------------------------|---|------|
| 41 | Cuba | 1 | YES |
| 42 | Cyprus | 0 | NA |
| 43 | Czech Republic | 1 | NO |
| 44 | Democratic Republic of the Congo | 1 | NV |
| 45 | Denmark | 1 | NO |
| 46 | Djibouti | 0 | NA |
| 47 | Dominica | 0 | NA |
| 48 | Dominican Republic | 1 | ABST |
| 49 | Ecuador | 1 | NVP |
| 50 | Egypt | 1 | YES |
| 51 | El Salvador | 1 | YES |
| 52 | Equatorial Guinea | 0 | NA |
| 53 | Eritrea | 0 | NA |
| 54 | Estonia | 1 | NO |
| 55 | Ethiopia | 1 | YES |
| 56 | Fiji | 0 | NA |
| 57 | Finland | 1 | NO |
| 58 | France | 1 | NO |
| 59 | Gabon | 0 | NA |
| 60 | Gambia | 1 | YES |
| 61 | Georgia | 1 | NV |
| 62 | Germany | 1 | NO |
| 63 | Ghana | 1 | YES |
| 64 | Greece | 1 | NO |
| 65 | Grenada | 1 | NO |
| 66 | Guatemala | 1 | YES |
| 67 | Guinea | 1 | YES |
| 68 | Guinea-Bissau | 0 | NA |
| 69 | Guyana | 1 | YES |
| 70 | Honduras | 1 | YES |
| 71 | Hungary | 1 | NO |
| 72 | Iceland | 1 | ABST |
| 73 | India | 1 | NO |
| 74 | Indonesia | 1 | YES |
| 75 | Iran (Islamic Republic of) | 0 | NA |
| 76 | Ireland | 1 | NO |
| 77 | Israel | 1 | NO |
| 78 | Italy | 1 | NO |
| 79 | Jamaica | 1 | ABST |
| 80 | Japan | 1 | ABST |
| 81 | Jordan | 1 | ABST |
| 82 | Kazakhstan | 0 | NA |
| 83 | Kenya | 1 | ABST |
| 84 | Kuwait | 1 | YES |
| 85 | Kyrgyzstan | 0 | NA |
| 86 | Lao People's Democratic Republic | 1 | NVP |
| 87 | Latvia | 1 | NO |

| | | | |
|-----|-----------------------|---|------|
| 88 | Lesotho | 0 | NA |
| 89 | Liberia | 1 | YES |
| 90 | Libya | 1 | NVP |
| 91 | Liechtenstein | 1 | NV |
| 92 | Lithuania | 1 | NO |
| 93 | Luxembourg | 1 | NO |
| 94 | Madagascar | 1 | ABST |
| 95 | Malawi | 0 | NA |
| 96 | Malaysia | 1 | YES |
| 98 | Mali | 1 | YES |
| 99 | Maldives | 0 | NA |
| 100 | Malta | 1 | NO |
| 101 | Mauritania | 1 | ABST |
| 102 | Mauritius | 0 | NA |
| 103 | Mexico | 1 | YES |
| 104 | Monaco | 1 | NO |
| 105 | Mongolia | 0 | NA |
| 106 | Montenegro | 1 | NO |
| 107 | Morocco | 1 | NV |
| 108 | Mozambique | 1 | YES |
| 109 | Myanmar | 1 | ABST |
| 110 | Namibia | 1 | YES |
| 111 | Nepal | 1 | NO |
| 112 | Netherlands | 1 | NO |
| 113 | New Zealand | 1 | NO |
| 114 | Nicaragua | 0 | NA |
| 115 | Niger | 1 | NVP |
| 116 | Nigeria | 0 | NA |
| 117 | Norway | 1 | NO |
| 118 | Oman | 1 | ABST |
| 119 | Pakistan | 1 | YES |
| 120 | Palau | 0 | NA |
| 121 | Panama | 1 | YES |
| 122 | Papua New Guinea | 0 | NA |
| 123 | Paraguay | 1 | YES |
| 124 | Peru | 1 | YES |
| 125 | Philippines | 1 | YES |
| 126 | Poland | 1 | NO |
| 127 | Portugal | 1 | NO |
| 128 | Qatar | 1 | YES |
| 129 | Republic of Korea | 1 | ABST |
| 130 | Republic of Moldova | 1 | NO |
| 131 | Romania | 1 | NO |
| 132 | Russian Federation | 1 | NO |
| 133 | Rwanda | 0 | NA |
| 134 | Saint Kitts and Nevis | 1 | YES |
| 135 | Saint Lucia | 1 | YES |

| | | | |
|-----|---|---|------|
| 136 | Saint Vincent and the Grenadines | 1 | YES |
| 137 | Samoa | 1 | ABST |
| 138 | San Marino | 0 | NA |
| 139 | Sao Tome and Principe | 1 | NV |
| 140 | Saudi Arabia | 0 | NA |
| 141 | Senegal | 1 | YES |
| 142 | Serbia | 1 | NO |
| 143 | Seychelles | 1 | NO |
| 144 | Sierra Leone | 1 | YES |
| 145 | Singapore | 1 | YES |
| 146 | Slovakia | 1 | NO |
| 147 | Slovenia | 1 | NO |
| 148 | Solomon Islands | 0 | NA |
| 149 | Somalia | 1 | YES |
| 150 | South Africa | 1 | YES |
| 151 | Spain | 1 | NO |
| 152 | Sri Lanka | 1 | YES |
| 153 | Sudan | 1 | NVP |
| 154 | Suriname | 1 | YES |
| 155 | Swaziland | 1 | NV |
| 156 | Sweden | 1 | NO |
| 157 | Switzerland | 1 | NO |
| 158 | Syrian Arab Republic | 0 | NA |
| 159 | Thailand | 1 | YES |
| 160 | The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia | 0 | NA |
| 161 | Togo | 1 | ABST |
| 162 | Trinidad and Tobago | 0 | NA |
| 163 | Tunisia | 1 | YES |
| 164 | Turkey | 1 | YES |
| 165 | Uganda | 1 | YES |
| 166 | Ukraine | 1 | NO |
| 167 | United Arab Emirates | 1 | ABST |
| 168 | United Kingdom | 1 | NO |
| 169 | United Republic of Tanzania | 1 | YES |
| 170 | United States | 1 | NO |
| 171 | Uruguay | 1 | YES |
| 172 | Uzbekistan | 0 | NA |
| 173 | Vanuatu | 1 | NV |
| 174 | Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of) | 1 | YES |
| 175 | Viet Nam | 1 | YES |
| 176 | Yemen | 1 | YES |
| 177 | Zambia | 1 | NV |
| 178 | Zimbabwe | 1 | YES |

VOTE ON AMENDMENT PROPOSAL COP16 PROP. 25
[CROCODYLUS SIAMENSIS (SIAMESE CROCODILE)]

List provided in English only.

| | | | |
|----|----------------------------------|---|------|
| 1 | Afghanistan | 0 | NA |
| 2 | Albania | 0 | NA |
| 3 | Algeria | 1 | NV |
| 4 | Antigua and Barbuda | 1 | YES |
| 5 | Argentina | 1 | YES |
| 6 | Armenia | 1 | YES |
| 7 | Australia | 1 | NO |
| 8 | Austria | 1 | NO |
| 9 | Azerbaijan | 1 | ABST |
| 10 | Bahamas | 1 | NO |
| 11 | Bahrain | 1 | ABST |
| 12 | Bangladesh | 0 | NA |
| 13 | Barbados | 0 | NA |
| 14 | Belarus | 1 | YES |
| 15 | Belgium | 1 | NO |
| 16 | Belize | 1 | YES |
| 17 | Benin | 1 | YES |
| 18 | Bhutan | 1 | YES |
| 19 | Bolivia (Plurinational State of) | 0 | NA |
| 20 | Bosnia and Herzegovina | 1 | NV |
| 21 | Botswana | 1 | YES |
| 22 | Brazil | 1 | YES |
| 23 | Brunei Darussalam | 1 | YES |
| 24 | Bulgaria | 1 | NO |
| 25 | Burkina Faso | 1 | YES |
| 26 | Burundi | 1 | YES |
| 27 | Cambodia | 1 | YES |
| 28 | Cameroon | 1 | YES |
| 29 | Canada | 1 | NO |
| 30 | Cape Verde | 0 | NA |
| 31 | Central African Republic | 1 | NV |
| 32 | Chad | 0 | NA |
| 33 | Chile | 1 | NO |
| 34 | China | 1 | YES |
| 35 | Colombia | 1 | YES |
| 36 | Comoros | 1 | NVP |
| 37 | Congo | 1 | YES |
| 38 | Costa Rica | 1 | YES |
| 39 | Côte d'Ivoire | 1 | YES |
| 40 | Croatia | 1 | NO |

| | | | |
|----|----------------------------------|---|------|
| 41 | Cuba | 1 | YES |
| 42 | Cyprus | 0 | NA |
| 43 | Czech Republic | 1 | NO |
| 44 | Democratic Republic of the Congo | 1 | YES |
| 45 | Denmark | 1 | NO |
| 46 | Djibouti | 0 | NA |
| 47 | Dominica | 0 | NA |
| 48 | Dominican Republic | 1 | NO |
| 49 | Ecuador | 1 | YES |
| 50 | Egypt | 1 | YES |
| 51 | El Salvador | 1 | YES |
| 52 | Equatorial Guinea | 0 | NA |
| 53 | Eritrea | 0 | NA |
| 54 | Estonia | 1 | NO |
| 55 | Ethiopia | 1 | YES |
| 56 | Fiji | 0 | NA |
| 57 | Finland | 1 | NO |
| 58 | France | 1 | NO |
| 59 | Gabon | 0 | NA |
| 60 | Gambia | 1 | YES |
| 61 | Georgia | 1 | YES |
| 62 | Germany | 1 | NO |
| 63 | Ghana | 1 | YES |
| 64 | Greece | 1 | NO |
| 65 | Grenada | 1 | NO |
| 66 | Guatemala | 1 | NVP |
| 67 | Guinea | 1 | YES |
| 68 | Guinea-Bissau | 0 | NA |
| 69 | Guyana | 1 | YES |
| 70 | Honduras | 1 | NVP |
| 71 | Hungary | 1 | NO |
| 72 | Iceland | 1 | NO |
| 73 | India | 1 | NO |
| 74 | Indonesia | 1 | YES |
| 75 | Iran (Islamic Republic of) | 0 | NA |
| 76 | Ireland | 1 | NO |
| 77 | Israel | 1 | NO |
| 78 | Italy | 1 | NO |
| 79 | Jamaica | 1 | ABST |
| 80 | Japan | 1 | ABST |
| 81 | Jordan | 1 | ABST |
| 82 | Kazakhstan | 0 | NA |
| 83 | Kenya | 1 | YES |
| 84 | Kuwait | 1 | YES |
| 85 | Kyrgyzstan | 0 | NA |
| 86 | Lao People's Democratic Republic | 1 | YES |
| 87 | Latvia | 1 | NO |

| | | | |
|-----|-----------------------|---|------|
| 88 | Lesotho | 0 | NA |
| 89 | Liberia | 1 | YES |
| 90 | Libya | 1 | NVP |
| 91 | Liechtenstein | 1 | NV |
| 92 | Lithuania | 1 | NO |
| 93 | Luxembourg | 1 | NO |
| 94 | Madagascar | 1 | YES |
| 95 | Malawi | 0 | NA |
| 96 | Malaysia | 1 | YES |
| 98 | Mali | 1 | YES |
| 99 | Maldives | 0 | NA |
| 100 | Malta | 1 | NO |
| 101 | Mauritania | 1 | YES |
| 102 | Mauritius | 0 | NA |
| 103 | Mexico | 1 | NO |
| 104 | Monaco | 1 | ABST |
| 105 | Mongolia | 0 | NA |
| 106 | Montenegro | 1 | NO |
| 107 | Morocco | 1 | NV |
| 108 | Mozambique | 1 | YES |
| 109 | Myanmar | 1 | YES |
| 110 | Namibia | 1 | YES |
| 111 | Nepal | 1 | NO |
| 112 | Netherlands | 1 | NO |
| 113 | New Zealand | 1 | NO |
| 114 | Nicaragua | 0 | NA |
| 115 | Niger | 1 | YES |
| 116 | Nigeria | 0 | NA |
| 117 | Norway | 1 | NO |
| 118 | Oman | 1 | YES |
| 119 | Pakistan | 1 | YES |
| 120 | Palau | 0 | NA |
| 121 | Panama | 1 | YES |
| 122 | Papua New Guinea | 0 | NA |
| 123 | Paraguay | 1 | ABST |
| 124 | Peru | 1 | YES |
| 125 | Philippines | 1 | YES |
| 126 | Poland | 1 | NO |
| 127 | Portugal | 1 | NO |
| 128 | Qatar | 1 | YES |
| 129 | Republic of Korea | 1 | YES |
| 130 | Republic of Moldova | 1 | NO |
| 131 | Romania | 1 | NO |
| 132 | Russian Federation | 1 | NO |
| 133 | Rwanda | 0 | NA |
| 134 | Saint Kitts and Nevis | 1 | YES |
| 135 | Saint Lucia | 1 | YES |

| | | | |
|-----|---|---|------|
| 136 | Saint Vincent and the Grenadines | 1 | YES |
| 137 | Samoa | 1 | ABST |
| 138 | San Marino | 0 | NA |
| 139 | Sao Tome and Principe | 1 | NV |
| 140 | Saudi Arabia | 0 | NA |
| 141 | Senegal | 1 | YES |
| 142 | Serbia | 1 | NO |
| 143 | Seychelles | 1 | NO |
| 144 | Sierra Leone | 1 | NO |
| 145 | Singapore | 1 | YES |
| 146 | Slovakia | 1 | NO |
| 147 | Slovenia | 1 | NO |
| 148 | Solomon Islands | 0 | NA |
| 149 | Somalia | 1 | YES |
| 150 | South Africa | 1 | YES |
| 151 | Spain | 1 | NO |
| 152 | Sri Lanka | 1 | YES |
| 153 | Sudan | 1 | YES |
| 154 | Suriname | 1 | YES |
| 155 | Swaziland | 1 | NV |
| 156 | Sweden | 1 | NO |
| 157 | Switzerland | 1 | NO |
| 158 | Syrian Arab Republic | 0 | NA |
| 159 | Thailand | 1 | YES |
| 160 | The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia | 0 | NA |
| 161 | Togo | 1 | YES |
| 162 | Trinidad and Tobago | 0 | NA |
| 163 | Tunisia | 1 | YES |
| 164 | Turkey | 1 | NO |
| 165 | Uganda | 1 | YES |
| 166 | Ukraine | 1 | ABST |
| 167 | United Arab Emirates | 1 | ABST |
| 168 | United Kingdom | 1 | NO |
| 169 | United Republic of Tanzania | 1 | YES |
| 170 | United States | 1 | NO |
| 171 | Uruguay | 1 | YES |
| 172 | Uzbekistan | 0 | NA |
| 173 | Vanuatu | 1 | NVP |
| 174 | Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of) | 1 | YES |
| 175 | Viet Nam | 1 | YES |
| 176 | Yemen | 1 | YES |
| 177 | Zambia | 1 | NV |
| 178 | Zimbabwe | 1 | ABST |