

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES  
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

Sixteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties  
Bangkok (Thailand), 3-14 March 2013

Summary record of the 12th session of Committee I

12 March 2013: 9h10-11h55

Chair: C. Caceres (Canada)  
Secretariat: J. Scanlon  
D. Morgan  
Rapporteurs: L. Garrett  
S. Glaser  
R. Parry-Jones  
C. Rutherford

The entry into force of the Convention in Maldives was recognized by the Secretary-General who replaced its non-Party name plate with that for a voting member. Maldives assured Parties that it would work with the global community on conservation matters.

***Interpretation and implementation of the Convention***

Amendment of the Appendices

77. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II

Proposal CoP16 Prop. 47 to include *Paratrygon aiereba* (Ceja river stingray) in Appendix II, with the annotation presented in that document, was introduced by Colombia, which noted that the species was of commercial interest. It believed that inclusion in Appendix II would ensure sustainable use.

Argentina, the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela, Brazil, Costa Rica, Ecuador, El Salvador, Madagascar, Panama, Qatar, Senegal and Defenders of Wildlife supported the proposal.

Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, did not support the proposal and believed that listing in Appendix III would provide the data needed to assess whether the species warranted inclusion in Appendix II. The Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) reported that the Expert Panel had decided that there was not enough information to determine whether the species met the criteria for inclusion in Appendix II, and it suggested that national management and regulation was more appropriate. Ornamental Fish International did not support the proposal either, pointing out that captive breeding was taking place and recommending inclusion in Appendix III.

Realizing that there was no consensus, the Chair called for a vote on proposal CoP16 Prop. 47. Fifty-one Parties were in favour, 51 against, and 19 abstained (see Annex 1); the proposal was therefore not accepted.

Colombia introduced proposal CoP16 Prop. 48 to include *Potamotrygon motoro* (ocellate river stingray) and *P. schroederi* (rosette river stingray) in Appendix II, drawing attention to additional information in document CoP16 Inf. 28. Argentina, the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela, Brazil, Ecuador and Uruguay, all range States of one or both of these species, expressed support for the proposal, which was echoed by Qatar, Senegal, the United States of America and the Species Survival Network.

Paraguay, also a range State of one of the species, felt that its population had not been taken into account, stating that national legislation ensured there were no human pressures on it. With Guyana, also a range State, Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, and the European Pet Organization, it believed it was more appropriate to include this species in Appendix III. FAO believed that there was insufficient information to show that the species met the criteria for inclusion in Appendix II, suggesting it would be more useful to strengthen management measures at country level.

Seeing no consensus, the Chair proposed a vote. Fifty-five parties voted in favour of the proposal, 52 against, and 25 abstained. Proposal CoP16 Prop. 48 was therefore not accepted (see Annex 2).

### **Strategic matters**

#### 17. Intergovernmental Science-Policy Platform on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services

Mexico presented document CoP16 Com. I. 4 containing four draft decisions prepared by a drafting group, based on document CoP16 Doc. 17 (Rev. 1). These were accepted by consensus. It was agreed to repeal Decisions 15.12, 15.13 and 15.14.

### **Interpretation and implementation of the Convention**

#### Species trade and conservation

#### 65. Regional cooperation on the management of and trade in the queen conch (*Strombus gigas*)

Colombia introduced document CoP16 Com. I.5 containing the report of the drafting group on matters arising from the discussion on document CoP16 Doc. 65 (Rev. 1) Two corrections were noted: replace "16.FF" with 16.HH in paragraph 16.FF.; and replace "16.EE" with 16.FF in paragraph 16.HH. Colombia also requested some changes to the Spanish version as follows: replace "educación del público" with educación pública in paragraph 16.EE; replace "con arreglo" with de acuerdo in paragraphs 16.FF and 16.HH; and replace "normas" with estándares in paragraph 16.GG a).

Belize, Cuba, Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, Jamaica and FAO supported the draft decisions. Belize, Cuba and Jamaica offered assistance in implementing them.

France said that it would provide non-substantive editorial amendments to the French version to the Secretariat. It also proposed inserting the words mentioned in 16.AA after "Working Group on Queen Conch" in paragraphs 16.CC a) and 16.HH. This was agreed and the eight draft decisions contained in CoP16 Com. I.5, as amended, were accepted by consensus.

#### Amendment of the Appendices

#### 77. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II

Proposal CoP16 Prop. 49 to transfer *Papilio hospiton* (Corsican swallowtail butterfly) from Appendix I to Appendix II was introduced by Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia.

Switzerland and Peru supported the proposal, the former noting that international trade did not present a threat to the species and that the proposal had been endorsed by the Animals Committee under the *Periodic review of the Appendices*.

Proposal CoP16 Prop. 49 was accepted by consensus.

Proposal CoP16 Prop. 50 to include *Yucca queretaroensis* (Queretaro yucca) in Appendix II was introduced by Mexico.

Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, was concerned that there was little information on levels of trade and impacts of harvest but, noting the slow-growing nature of the species, its restricted distribution and reports of demand being met by wild specimens, expressed support for the proposal.

Proposal CoP16 Prop. 50 was accepted by consensus.

The Committee agreed that seven proposals submitted by Madagascar to include various succulent plant species endemic to Madagascar in Appendix II could be considered together. These proposals were CoP16 Prop. 51 concerning *Operculicarya decaryi* (jabihy); CoP16 Prop. 64 concerning *Senna meridionalis* (taraby); CoP16 Prop. 65 concerning *Adenia firingalavensis* (bottle liana); CoP16 Prop. 66 concerning *Adenia subsessifolia* (katakata); CoP16 Prop. 67 concerning *Uncarina grandidieri* (uncarina); CoP16 Prop. 68 concerning *Uncarina stellulifera* (uncarina); and CoP16 Prop. 71 concerning *Cyphostemma laza* (laza).

The United States commended Madagascar, recognizing the significant fieldwork that had been conducted by the IUCN/SSC Madagascar Plant Specialist Group and Madagascar Scientific Authority since CoP15, and noted the existence of a niche market in the United States for these species. It, together with Nigeria and Qatar, supported the proposal. South Africa, noting its consultation with Madagascar which had revealed the collection of wild specimens for trade, stated it would not oppose the proposals.

Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, believed several of the species to be widespread and demand to be met by artificial propagation, and therefore could not support the proposal but would not block consensus.

IUCN reported that it would be finalizing Red List assessments of the species concerned, pending the availability of funds. The Documentation Center for Species Protection believed that all species met the criteria for inclusion in Appendix II, and that *Cyphostemma laza* met the criteria for inclusion in Appendix I, noting also that *C. laza* was traded in large quantities under the synonym "*Cissus laza*".

Proposals CoP16 Prop. 51, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68 and 71 were accepted by consensus.

Proposal CoP16 Prop. 52 to amend annotation #9 relating to *Hoodia* species was introduced by Namibia, one of the co-proponents, including minor amendments proposed by the Secretariat in document CoP16 Doc. 77, Annex 1, to replace "in" with under the. Namibia added that the list of entities registered to benefit from the exemption in the respective range States would be made available to Parties on request, and that Parties would be informed through a Notification about the details to be contained on labels.

Switzerland was concerned that the existing annotation did not fulfill the aim of CITES, and maintained its reservation, but would not block consensus. Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, welcomed the proposed amendments to annotation #9 and, supported by the United States, further requested that finished products be excluded. It also proposed a draft decision as follows:

***Directed to the Standing Committee***

16.XX *The Working Group on Annotations should review the annotation to the listing of Hoodia species with a view to its standardization and amendment, as appropriate.*

Namibia supported the draft decision but pointed out that the request to exclude all finished products would expand the scope of proposal CoP16 Prop. 52. The Chair concurred.

The proposal to amend annotation #9 with the minor revisions proposed by the Secretariat, and to include the draft decision directed to the Standing Committee, was accepted by consensus.

The meeting was adjourned at 11h55.

VOTE ON AMENDMENT PROPOSAL COP16 PROP. 47 TO INCLUDE  
PARATRYGON AIEREBA (CEJA RIVER STINGRAY) IN APPENDIX II

List provided in English only. Key of abbreviations:

*ABST = Abstain*

*NA = not allowed to vote*

*NV = did not vote and not present (or card not inserted into the microphone unit)*

*NVP = did not vote, but present (card inserted into the microphone unit but did not vote)*

1	Afghanistan	0	NA
2	Albania	0	NA
3	Algeria	1	NV
4	Antigua and Barbuda	1	NV
5	Argentina	1	YES
6	Armenia	1	NV
7	Australia	1	YES
8	Austria	1	NO
9	Azerbaijan	1	NV
10	Bahamas	1	YES
11	Bahrain	1	ABST
12	Bangladesh	0	NA
13	Barbados	0	NA
14	Belarus	1	YES
15	Belgium	1	NVP
16	Belize	1	YES
17	Benin	1	NVP
18	Bhutan	1	NV
19	Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	0	NA
20	Bosnia and Herzegovina	1	NV
21	Botswana	1	NO
22	Brazil	1	YES
23	Brunei Darussalam	1	NO
24	Bulgaria	1	NO
25	Burkina Faso	1	NV
26	Burundi	1	NV
27	Cambodia	1	NO
28	Cameroon	1	ABST
29	Canada	1	NO
30	Cape Verde	0	NA
31	Central African Republic	1	NV
32	Chad	0	NA
33	Chile	1	NO
34	China	1	NO
35	Colombia	1	YES
36	Comoros	1	YES

37	Congo	1	YES
38	Costa Rica	1	YES
39	Côte d'Ivoire	1	YES
40	Croatia	1	NO
41	Cuba	1	YES
42	Cyprus	1	NO
43	Czech Republic	1	NO
44	Democratic Republic of the Congo	1	ABST
45	Denmark	1	NO
46	Djibouti	0	NA
47	Dominica	0	NA
48	Dominican Republic	1	YES
49	Ecuador	1	YES
50	Egypt	1	YES
51	El Salvador	1	YES
52	Equatorial Guinea	0	NA
53	Eritrea	1	ABST
54	Estonia	1	NO
55	Ethiopia	1	ABST
56	Fiji	1	NO
57	Finland	1	NO
58	France	1	NO
59	Gabon	1	NV
60	Gambia	1	YES
61	Georgia	1	NV
62	Germany	1	NO
63	Ghana	1	YES
64	Greece	1	NO
65	Grenada	1	ABST
66	Guatemala	1	YES
67	Guinea	1	YES
68	Guinea-Bissau	0	NA
69	Guyana	1	NO
70	Honduras	1	NV
71	Hungary	1	NO
72	Iceland	1	YES
73	India	1	YES
74	Indonesia	1	ABST
75	Iran (Islamic Republic of)	0	NA
76	Ireland	1	NO
77	Israel	1	NV
78	Italy	1	NO
79	Jamaica	1	YES
80	Japan	1	NO
81	Jordan	1	ABST
82	Kazakhstan	0	NA
83	Kenya	1	YES

84	Kuwait	1	NV
85	Kyrgyzstan	1	YES
86	Lao People's Democratic Republic	1	NO
87	Latvia	1	NO
88	Lesotho	0	NA
89	Liberia	1	YES
90	Libya	1	NV
91	Liechtenstein	1	NV
92	Lithuania	1	NO
93	Luxembourg	1	NO
94	Madagascar	1	YES
95	Malawi	0	NA
96	Malaysia	1	NO
98	Mali	1	NVP
99	Maldives	1	YES
100	Malta	1	NO
101	Mauritania	1	NV
102	Mauritius	0	NA
103	Mexico	1	YES
104	Monaco	1	YES
105	Mongolia	0	NA
106	Montenegro	1	NO
107	Morocco	1	ABST
108	Mozambique	1	ABST
109	Myanmar	1	NO
110	Namibia	1	YES
111	Nepal	1	ABST
112	Netherlands	1	NO
113	New Zealand	1	ABST
114	Nicaragua	0	NA
115	Niger	1	YES
116	Nigeria	0	NA
117	Norway	1	NO
118	Oman	1	ABST
119	Pakistan	1	YES
120	Palau	0	NA
121	Panama	1	YES
122	Papua New Guinea	1	YES
123	Paraguay	1	NO
124	Peru	1	NO
125	Philippines	1	YES
126	Poland	1	NO
127	Portugal	1	NO
128	Qatar	1	YES
129	Republic of Korea	1	YES
130	Republic of Moldova	1	NVP
131	Romania	1	NO

132	Russian Federation	1	ABST
133	Rwanda	0	NA
134	Saint Kitts and Nevis	1	ABST
135	Saint Lucia	1	NO
136	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	1	NO
137	Samoa	1	ABST
138	San Marino	0	NA
139	Sao Tome and Principe	1	ABST
140	Saudi Arabia	0	NA
141	Senegal	1	YES
142	Serbia	1	NV
143	Seychelles	1	YES
144	Sierra Leone	1	YES
145	Singapore	1	NO
146	Slovakia	1	NO
147	Slovenia	1	NO
148	Solomon Islands	0	NA
149	Somalia	1	NO
150	South Africa	1	YES
151	Spain	1	NO
152	Sri Lanka	1	NV
153	Sudan	1	YES
154	Suriname	1	YES
155	Swaziland	1	NV
156	Sweden	1	NO
157	Switzerland	1	NO
158	Syrian Arab Republic	0	NA
159	Thailand	1	YES
160	The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	0	NA
161	Togo	1	NO
162	Trinidad and Tobago	0	NA
163	Tunisia	1	NV
164	Turkey	1	ABST
165	Uganda	1	YES
166	Ukraine	1	NV
167	United Arab Emirates	1	NO
168	United Kingdom	1	NO
169	United Republic of Tanzania	1	YES
170	United States	1	YES
171	Uruguay	1	YES
172	Uzbekistan	0	NA
173	Vanuatu	1	YES
174	Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	1	YES
175	Viet Nam	1	NO
176	Yemen	1	NV
177	Zambia	1	NV
178	Zimbabwe	1	ABST





VOTE ON AMENDMENT PROPOSAL COP16 PROP. 48 TO INCLUDE *POTAMOTRYGON MOTORO*  
(OCELLATE RIVER STINGRAY) AND *P. SCHROEDERI* (ROSETTE RIVER STINGRAY) IN APPENDIX II

*List provided in English only.*

1	Afghanistan	0	NA
2	Albania	0	NA
3	Algeria	1	NVP
4	Antigua and Barbuda	1	NV
5	Argentina	1	YES
6	Armenia	1	NV
7	Australia	1	YES
8	Austria	1	NO
9	Azerbaijan	1	NV
10	Bahamas	1	YES
11	Bahrain	1	ABST
12	Bangladesh	0	NA
13	Barbados	0	NA
14	Belarus	1	YES
15	Belgium	1	NO
16	Belize	1	YES
17	Benin	1	NO
18	Bhutan	1	NV
19	Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	0	NA
20	Bosnia and Herzegovina	1	NV
21	Botswana	1	NO
22	Brazil	1	YES
23	Brunei Darussalam	1	NO
24	Bulgaria	1	NO
25	Burkina Faso	1	YES
26	Burundi	1	NO
27	Cambodia	1	NO
28	Cameroon	1	ABST
29	Canada	1	NO
30	Cape Verde	0	NA
31	Central African Republic	1	ABST
32	Chad	0	NA
33	Chile	1	NO
34	China	1	NO
35	Colombia	1	YES
36	Comoros	1	YES
37	Congo	1	YES
38	Costa Rica	1	YES
39	Côte d'Ivoire	1	ABST
40	Croatia	1	NO

41	Cuba	1	YES
42	Cyprus	1	NO
43	Czech Republic	1	NO
44	Democratic Republic of the Congo	1	ABST
45	Denmark	1	NO
46	Djibouti	0	NA
47	Dominica	0	NA
48	Dominican Republic	1	YES
49	Ecuador	1	YES
50	Egypt	1	YES
51	El Salvador	1	YES
52	Equatorial Guinea	0	NA
53	Eritrea	1	ABST
54	Estonia	1	NO
55	Ethiopia	1	ABST
56	Fiji	1	NO
57	Finland	1	NO
58	France	1	NO
59	Gabon	1	NV
60	Gambia	1	YES
61	Georgia	1	YES
62	Germany	1	NO
63	Ghana	1	YES
64	Greece	1	NO
65	Grenada	1	ABST
66	Guatemala	1	YES
67	Guinea	1	YES
68	Guinea-Bissau	0	NA
69	Guyana	1	NO
70	Honduras	1	NV
71	Hungary	1	NO
72	Iceland	1	YES
73	India	1	ABST
74	Indonesia	1	ABST
75	Iran (Islamic Republic of)	0	NA
76	Ireland	1	NO
77	Israel	1	NV
78	Italy	1	NO
79	Jamaica	1	YES
80	Japan	1	NO
81	Jordan	1	ABST
82	Kazakhstan	0	NA
83	Kenya	1	YES
84	Kuwait	1	NV
85	Kyrgyzstan	1	YES
86	Lao People's Democratic Republic	1	NO
87	Latvia	1	NO

88	Lesotho	0	NA
89	Liberia	1	YES
90	Libya	1	YES
91	Liechtenstein	1	NV
92	Lithuania	1	NO
93	Luxembourg	1	NO
94	Madagascar	1	YES
95	Malawi	0	NA
96	Malaysia	1	NO
98	Mali	1	YES
99	Maldives	1	YES
100	Malta	1	NO
101	Mauritania	1	ABST
102	Mauritius	0	NA
103	Mexico	1	YES
104	Monaco	1	YES
105	Mongolia	0	NA
106	Montenegro	1	NO
107	Morocco	1	ABST
108	Mozambique	1	ABST
109	Myanmar	1	NO
110	Namibia	1	YES
111	Nepal	1	ABST
112	Netherlands	1	NO
113	New Zealand	1	ABST
114	Nicaragua	0	NA
115	Niger	1	YES
116	Nigeria	0	NA
117	Norway	1	NO
118	Oman	1	ABST
119	Pakistan	1	YES
120	Palau	0	NA
121	Panama	1	YES
122	Papua New Guinea	1	NV
123	Paraguay	1	NO
124	Peru	1	YES
125	Philippines	1	YES
126	Poland	1	NO
127	Portugal	1	NO
128	Qatar	1	YES
129	Republic of Korea	1	YES
130	Republic of Moldova	1	NVP
131	Romania	1	NO
132	Russian Federation	1	ABST
133	Rwanda	0	NA
134	Saint Kitts and Nevis	1	ABST
135	Saint Lucia	1	NO

136	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	1	NO
137	Samoa	1	ABST
138	San Marino	0	NA
139	Sao Tome and Principe	1	YES
140	Saudi Arabia	0	NA
141	Senegal	1	YES
142	Serbia	1	YES
143	Seychelles	1	YES
144	Sierra Leone	1	YES
145	Singapore	1	NO
146	Slovakia	1	NO
147	Slovenia	1	NO
148	Solomon Islands	0	NA
149	Somalia	1	YES
150	South Africa	1	ABST
151	Spain	1	NO
152	Sri Lanka	1	NV
153	Sudan	1	ABST
154	Suriname	1	YES
155	Swaziland	1	NV
156	Sweden	1	NO
157	Switzerland	1	NO
158	Syrian Arab Republic	0	NA
159	Thailand	1	YES
160	The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	0	NA
161	Togo	1	NO
162	Trinidad and Tobago	0	NA
163	Tunisia	1	NV
164	Turkey	1	ABST
165	Uganda	1	YES
166	Ukraine	1	ABST
167	United Arab Emirates	1	YES
168	United Kingdom	1	NO
169	United Republic of Tanzania	1	NO
170	United States	1	YES
171	Uruguay	1	YES
172	Uzbekistan	0	NA
173	Vanuatu	1	YES
174	Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	1	YES
175	Viet Nam	1	NO
176	Yemen	1	YES
177	Zambia	1	NV
178	Zimbabwe	1	ABST